

## Apology: Examination of Meletus

Meletus makes two charges: Socrates is guilty of corrupting the young and of not believing in the gods in whom the city believes, but in other spiritual things. (24b)

### *First Argument (24d-25c)*

1. Everyone other than Socrates improves young men, but Socrates alone corrupts them. [Part of Meletus' first charge]
2. One man (the horse-breeder) improves horses, but everyone else corrupts them.
3. What goes for horses goes for all animals. [Induction]
4. Humans are animals.
- So, 5. One man improves young men, but everyone else corrupts them. [2, 3, 4]
6. If X corrupts Y, then X does not improve Y.
- So, 7. One man (namely, Socrates) does not improve young men, and everyone else does not corrupt them. [1, 6]

Contradiction at 5 and 7. So 1, 2, 3, 4 and 6 can't all be true.

### *Second Argument (25c-26a)*

1. Socrates corrupts the young (i.e., those who are close to him) willingly. [Part of Meletus' first charge]
2. To corrupt X is to make X bad.
- So, 3. Socrates willingly makes those who are close to him bad. [1, 2]
4. Socrates knows that the bad harm those who are close to them.
5. Socrates knows that, if the bad harm those who are close to them, then making those close to him bad will result in his being harmed.
6. If X knows **P** and X knows that **if P then Q**, then X knows **Q**.

- So, 7. Socrates knows that making those close to him bad will result in his being harmed. [4, 5, 6]
8. If X willingly does A and X knows that doing A will result in B, then X wants B.
- So, 9. Socrates wants to be harmed. [3, 7, 8]
10. No man wants to be harmed.
11. Socrates is a man.
- So, 12. Socrates does not want to be harmed. [10, 11]

Contradiction on 9 and 12. So 1, 2, 4, 5, 6, 8, 10 and 11 can't all be true.

*Third Argument* (26b-27b, setup; 27b-28a, argument)

1. Socrates believes in spiritual activities (namely, his spiritual sign or inner voice) but does not believe in gods. [Meletus' second charge]
2. Every man who believes in human activities believes in humans.
3. Every man who believes in flute-playing believes in flute-players.
4. Every man who believes in horsemen's activities believes in horsemen.
- So, 5. Every man who believes in X's activities believes in X. [2, 3, 4: by induction]
- So, 6. Every man who believes in spiritual activities believes in spirits. [5]
7. Spirits are gods or children of gods.
8. Socrates is a man.
- So, 9. Socrates believes in gods or children of gods. [1, 6, 7, 8]
10. If X believes in children of gods, then X believes in gods.
- So, 11. Socrates believes in gods. [9, 10]

Contradiction on 1 and 11. So 1, 2, 3, 4, 7, 8 and 10 can't all be true.